

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**  
**Before the**  
**SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION**

**INVESTMENT ADVISERS ACT OF 1940**  
**Release No. 5143 / March 11, 2019**

**ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDING**  
**File No. 3- 19046**

**In the Matter of**

**COMERICA SECURITIES,  
INC.**

**Respondent.**

**ORDER INSTITUTING ADMINISTRATIVE  
AND CEASE-AND-DESIST PROCEEDINGS,  
PURSUANT TO SECTIONS 203(e) AND  
203(k) OF THE INVESTMENT ADVISERS  
ACT OF 1940, MAKING FINDINGS, AND  
IMPOSING REMEDIAL SANCTIONS AND A  
CEASE-AND-DESIST ORDER**

**I.**

The Securities and Exchange Commission (“Commission”) deems it appropriate and in the public interest that public administrative and cease-and-desist proceedings be, and hereby are, instituted pursuant to Sections 203(e) and 203(k) of the Investment Advisers Act of 1940 (“Advisers Act”) against Comerica Securities, Inc. (“Respondent”).

**II.**

In anticipation of the institution of these proceedings, Respondent has submitted an Offer of Settlement (the “Offer”), which the Commission has determined to accept. Solely for the purpose of these proceedings and any other proceedings brought by or on behalf of the Commission, or to which the Commission is a party, and without admitting or denying the findings herein, except as to the Commission’s jurisdiction over it and the subject matter of these proceedings, which are admitted, Respondent consents to the entry of this Order Instituting Administrative and Cease-and-Desist Proceedings, Pursuant to Sections 203(e) and 203(k) of the Investment Advisers Act of 1940, Making Findings, and Imposing Remedial Sanctions and a Cease-and-Desist Order (“Order”), as set forth below.

**III.**

On the basis of this Order and Respondent’s Offer, the Commission finds<sup>1</sup> that:

---

<sup>1</sup> The findings herein are made pursuant to Respondent’s Offer of Settlement and are not binding on any other person or entity in this or any other proceeding.

## **Summary**

1. These proceedings arise out of breaches of fiduciary duty and inadequate disclosures by registered investment adviser Comerica Securities, Inc. in connection with its mutual fund share class selection practices and the fees it received pursuant to Rule 12b-1 under the Investment Company Act of 1940 (“12b-1 fees”). At times during the period January 1, 2014 to June 12, 2018 (the “Relevant Period”), Respondent purchased, recommended, or held for advisory clients mutual fund share classes that charged 12b-1 fees instead of lower-cost share classes of the same funds for which the clients were eligible. Respondent and its associated persons received 12b-1 fees in connection with these investments. Respondent failed to disclose in its Form ADV or otherwise the conflicts of interest related to (a) its receipt of 12b-1 fees, and/or (b) its selection of mutual fund share classes that pay such fees. During the Relevant Period, Respondent and its associated persons received 12b-1 fees for advising clients to invest in or hold such mutual fund share class.

2. Respondent self-reported to the Commission the violations discussed in this Order pursuant to the Division of Enforcement’s (the “Division”) Share Class Selection Disclosure Initiative (“SCSD Initiative”).<sup>2</sup> Accordingly, this Order and Respondent’s Offer are based on the information self-reported by Respondent.

## **Respondent**

3. Respondent Comerica Securities, Inc., incorporated in Michigan and headquartered in Detroit, Michigan, has been dually registered with the Commission as an investment adviser and broker-dealer since 2005. In its Form ADV filed June 12, 2018, Respondent reported regulatory assets under management of approximately \$1,426,650,065.

## **Mutual Fund Share Class Selection**

4. Mutual funds typically offer investors different types of shares or “share classes.” Each share class represents an interest in the same portfolio of securities with the same investment objective. The primary difference among the share classes is the fee structure.

5. For example, some mutual fund share classes charge 12b-1 fees to cover fund distribution and sometimes shareholder service expenses. These recurring fees, which are included in a mutual fund’s total annual fund operating expenses, vary by share class, but typically range from 25 to 100 basis points. They are deducted from the mutual fund’s assets on an ongoing basis and paid to the fund’s distributor or principal underwriter, which generally remits the 12b-1 fees to the broker-dealer that distributed or sold the shares.

---

<sup>2</sup> See Div. of Enforcement, U.S. Sec. & Exch. Comm’n, Share Class Selection Disclosure Initiative, <https://www.sec.gov/enforce/announcement/scsd-initiative> (last modified Feb. 12, 2018).

6. Many mutual funds also offer share classes that do not charge 12b-1 fees (e.g., “Institutional Class” or “Class I” shares (collectively, “Class I shares”)).<sup>3</sup> An investor who holds Class I shares of a mutual fund will usually pay lower total annual fund operating expenses over time – and thus will almost always earn higher returns – than one who holds a share class of the same fund that charges 12b-1 fees. Therefore, if a mutual fund offers a Class I share, and an investor is eligible to own it, it is often, though not always, better for the investor to purchase or hold the Class I share.

7. During the Relevant Period, Respondent advised clients to purchase or hold<sup>4</sup> mutual fund share classes that charged 12b-1 fees when lower-cost share classes of those same funds were available to those clients. Respondent received 12b-1 fees that it would not have collected had those clients been invested in the available lower-cost share classes.

### **Inadequate Disclosures Concerning Mutual Fund Investments**

8. As an investment adviser, Respondent was obligated to disclose all material facts to its clients, including any conflicts of interest between itself and/or its associated persons and its clients that could affect the advisory relationship and how those conflicts could impact advice the Respondent provided its clients. Relevant to the issue herein, Respondent was required to give its clients sufficient information so that they could understand the conflicts of interest of the Respondent concerning its advice about investing in the different classes of mutual funds and have a basis on which they could consent to or reject such conflicted transactions.

9. At times during the Relevant Period, Respondent did not disclose adequately to its clients either in its Forms ADV or otherwise its conflicts of interest related to (a) its receipt of 12b-1 fees, and/or (b) its selection of mutual fund share classes that pay such fees.

### **Violations**

10. As a result of the conduct described above, Respondent willfully<sup>5</sup> violated Section 206(2) of the Advisers Act, which makes it unlawful for any investment adviser, directly or indirectly, to “engage in any transaction, practice or course of business which operates as a fraud or deceit upon any client or prospective client.” Scienter is not required to establish a violation of Section 206(2), but rather may rest on a finding of negligence. *SEC v. Steadman*, 967 F.2d 636,

---

<sup>3</sup> Share classes that do not charge 12b-1 fees also go by a variety of other names in the mutual fund industry, such as “Class F2,” “Class Y” and “Class Z” shares. As used in this Order, the term “Class I shares” refers generically to share classes that do not charge 12b-1 fees.

<sup>4</sup> In many cases, mutual funds permit certain advisory clients who hold shares in classes charging 12b-1 fees to convert those shares to Class I shares without cost or tax consequences to the client.

<sup>5</sup> A willful violation of the securities laws means merely “that the person charged with the duty knows what he is doing.” *Wonsover v. SEC*, 205 F.3d 408, 414 (D.C. Cir. 2000) (quoting *Hughes v. SEC*, 174 F.2d 969, 977 (D.C. Cir. 1949)). There is no requirement that the actor “also be aware that he is violating one of the Rules or Acts.” *Id.* (quoting *Gearhart & Otis, Inc. v. SEC*, 348 F.2d 798, 803 (D.C. Cir. 1965)).

643 n.5 (D.C. Cir. 1992) (citing *SEC v. Capital Gains Research Bureau, Inc.*, 375 U.S. 180,194-95 (1963)).

11. As a result of the conduct described above, Respondent willfully violated Section 207 of the Advisers Act, which makes it “unlawful for any person willfully to make any untrue statement of a material fact in any registration application or report filed with the Commission . . . or willfully to omit to state in any such application or report any material fact which is required to be stated therein.”

### **Self-Reporting**

12. In determining to accept Respondent’s offer, the Commission considered that Respondent self-reported its conduct to the Commission pursuant to the SCSD Initiative. In addition, the Commission acknowledges that Respondent has complied with the undertakings identified in paragraphs 13.a and 13.b below.

### **Undertakings**

13. Respondent has undertaken to:

- a. Within 30 days of the entry of this Order, review and correct as necessary all relevant disclosure documents concerning mutual fund share class selection and 12b-1 fees.
- b. Within 30 days of the entry of this Order, evaluate whether existing clients should be moved to a lower-cost share class and move clients as necessary.
- c. Within 30 days of the entry of this Order, evaluate, update (if necessary), and review for the effectiveness of their implementation, Respondent’s policies and procedures so that they are reasonably designed to prevent violations of the Advisers Act in connection with disclosures regarding mutual fund share class selection.
- d. Within 30 days of the entry of this Order, notify affected investors (*i.e.*, those former and current clients who, during the Relevant Period of inadequate disclosure, purchased or held 12b-1 fee paying share class mutual funds when a lower-cost share class of the same fund was available to the client) (hereinafter, “affected investors”) of the settlement terms of this Order in a clear and conspicuous fashion.
- e. Within 40 days of the entry of this Order, certify, in writing, compliance with the undertaking(s) ordered pursuant to Section IV.E., below. The certification shall identify the undertaking(s), provide written evidence of compliance in the form of a narrative, and be supported by exhibits sufficient to demonstrate compliance. The certification and supporting material shall be submitted to Paul Montoya, Assistant Regional Director, Asset Management Unit,

Chicago Regional Office, Securities and Exchange Commission, 175 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 1450, Chicago, IL, 60604 or such other address as the Commission staff may provide, with a copy to the Office of Chief Counsel of the Division of Enforcement, Securities and Exchange Commission, 100 F. Street, NE, Washington, DC 20549.

f. For good cause shown, the Commission staff may extend any of the procedural dates relating to these undertakings. Deadlines for procedural dates shall be counted in calendar days, except that if the last day falls on a weekend or federal holiday, the next business day shall be considered the last day.

#### IV.

In view of the foregoing, the Commission deems it appropriate, and in the public interest to impose the sanctions agreed to in Respondent's Offer.

Accordingly, pursuant to Sections 203(e) and 203(k) of the Advisers Act, it is hereby ORDERED that:

A. Respondent shall cease and desist from committing or causing any violations and any future violations of Sections 206(2) and 207 of the Advisers Act.

B. Respondent is censured.

C. Respondent shall pay disgorgement and prejudgment interest to affected investors, totaling \$186,377.71 as follows:

(i.) Respondent shall pay disgorgement of \$175,891.40 and prejudgment interest of \$10,486.31, consistent with the provisions of this Subsection C and subject to the offset provisions of Subsection C.(vii) below.

(ii.) Within ten (10) days of the entry of this Order, Respondent shall deposit the full amount of the disgorgement and prejudgment interest (the "Distribution Fund") into an escrow account at a financial institution not unacceptable to the Commission staff and Respondent shall provide evidence of such deposit in a form acceptable to the Commission staff. If timely deposit is not made, additional interest shall accrue pursuant to SEC Rule of Practice 600 [17 C.F.R. § 201.600].

(iii.) Respondent shall be responsible for administering the Distribution Fund and may hire a professional acceptable to the Commission, at its own cost, to assist it in the administration of the distribution. The costs and expenses of administering the Distribution Fund, including any such professional services, shall be borne by Respondent and shall not be paid out of the Distribution Fund.

(iv.) Respondent shall distribute the amount of the Distribution Fund to each affected investor an amount representing: (a) the 12b-1 fees attributable to the

affected investor during the Relevant Period; and (b) reasonable interest paid on such fees,<sup>6</sup> pursuant to a disbursement calculation (the “Calculation”) that will be submitted to, reviewed, and approved by the Commission staff in accordance with this Subsection C. The Calculation shall be subject to a *de minimis* threshold. No portion of the Distribution Fund shall be paid to any affected investor account in which Respondent or its past or present officers or directors have a financial interest.

(v.) Respondent shall, within ninety (90) days of the entry of this Order, submit a Calculation to the Commission staff for review and approval. Respondent shall also provide to the Commission staff such additional information and supporting documentation as the Commission staff may request for the purpose of its review. In the event of one or more objections by the Commission staff to Respondent’s proposed Calculation or any of its information or supporting documentation, Respondent shall submit a revised Calculation for the review and approval of the Commission staff or additional information or supporting documentation within ten (10) days of the date that Respondent is notified of the objection. The revised Calculation shall be subject to all of the provisions of this Subsection C.

(vi.) Respondent shall, within thirty (30) days of the written approval of the Calculation by the Commission staff, submit a payment file (the “Payment File”) for review and acceptance by the Commission staff demonstrating the application of the methodology to each affected investor. The Payment File should identify, at a minimum: (1) the name of each affected investor, (2) the exact amount of the payment to be made from the Distribution Fund to each affected investor, and (3) the application of a *de minimis* threshold.

(vii.) Respondent shall disburse all amounts payable to affected investors within 90 days of the date the Commission staff accepts the Payment File unless such time period is extended as provided in Paragraph (x.) of this Subsection C. The amount Respondent pays to affected investors on or after February 12, 2018, up until the lapse of 90 days following the date of staff’s acceptance of the Payment File for 12b-1 fees the Respondent received during the Relevant Period, will dollar for dollar offset the disgorgement payable to the Commission pursuant to this Subsection C, subject to approval by Commission staff. If, after Respondent’s reasonable efforts to distribute the Distribution Fund pursuant to the approved Payment File, Respondent is unable to distribute any portion of the Distribution Fund for good cause, including factors beyond Respondent’s control, Respondent shall transfer any such undistributed funds to the Commission for transmittal to the United States Treasury in accordance with Section 21F(g)(3) of the Securities

---

<sup>6</sup> Reasonable interest will be calculated at the Short-Term Applicable Federal Rate plus three percent (3%), compounded quarterly from the end of the year when Respondent received the 12b-1 fees to the date the Respondent completed its self-report pursuant to the SCSD Initiative.

Exchange Act of 1934 when the distribution of the funds is complete and before the final accounting provided for in Paragraph (ix.) below is submitted to Commission staff. Any such payment shall be made in accordance with Paragraph (xi.) below.

(viii.) A Distribution Fund is a Qualified Settlement Fund (“QSF”) under Section 468B(g) of the Internal Revenue Code (“IRC”), 26 U.S.C. §§1.468B.1-1.468B.5. Respondent agrees to be responsible for all tax compliance responsibilities associated with distribution of the Distribution Fund, including but not limited to tax obligations resulting from the Distribution Fund’s status as a QSF and the Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act (“FATCA”), and may retain any professional services necessary. The costs and expenses of any such professional services shall be borne by Respondent and shall not be paid by the Distribution Fund.

(ix.) Within 150 days after Respondent completes the distribution of all amounts payable to the affected investors, Respondent shall submit to the Commission staff a final accounting and certification of the disposition of the Distribution Fund for Commission approval. The final accounting shall be in a format to be provided by the Commission staff. The final accounting and certification shall include: (1) the amount paid to each affected investor, with reasonable interest; (2) the date of each payment; (3) the check number or other identifier of money transferred to each affected investor; (4) the amount of any returned payment and the date received; (5) a description of any effort to locate an affected investor whose payment was returned or to whom payment was not made for any reason; (6) the total amount, if any, to be forwarded to the Commission for transfer to the United States Treasury; and (7) an affirmation that Respondent has made payments from the Distribution Fund to affected investors in accordance with the Payment File approved by the Commission staff. Respondent shall submit the final accounting and certification, together with proof and supporting documentation of such payment in a form acceptable to Commission staff, under a cover letter that identifies Comerica Securities, Inc. as the Respondent in these proceedings and the file number of these proceedings to Paul Montoya, Assistant Regional Director, Asset Management Unit, Chicago Regional Office, Securities and Exchange Commission, 175 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 1450, Chicago, IL, 60604, or such other address as the Commission staff may provide. Any and all supporting documentation for the accounting and certification shall be provided to the Commission staff upon request, and Respondent shall cooperate with any additional requests by the Commission staff in connection with the accounting and certification.

(x.) The Commission staff may extend any of the procedural dates set forth in Paragraphs (ii.) through (ix.) of this Subsection C for good cause shown. Deadlines for dates relating to the Distribution Fund shall be counted in calendar days, except if the last day falls on a weekend or federal holiday, the next business day shall be considered the last day.

(xi.) Respondent's transfer of any undistributed funds to the Commission for transmittal to the United States Treasury must be made in one of the following ways:

(a) Respondent may transmit payment electronically to the Commission, which will provide detailed ACH transfer/Fedwire instructions upon request;

(b) Respondent may make direct payment from a bank account via Pay.gov through the SEC website at <http://www.sec.gov/about/offices/ofm.htm>; or

(c) Respondent may pay by certified check, bank cashier's check, or United States postal money order, made payable to the Securities and Exchange Commission and hand-delivered or mailed to:

Enterprise Services Center  
Accounts Receivable Branch  
HQ Bldg., Room 181, AMZ-341  
6500 South MacArthur Boulevard  
Oklahoma City, OK 73169

Payments by check or money order must be accompanied by a cover letter identifying Respondent as a Respondent in these proceedings, and the file number of these proceedings; a copy of the cover letter and check or money order must be sent to Paul Montoya, Assistant Regional Director, Asset Management Unit, Chicago Regional Office, Securities and Exchange Commission, 175 W. Jackson Blvd., Suite 1450, Chicago, IL, 60604, or such other address as the Commission staff may provide.

D. Respondent acknowledges that the Commission is not imposing a civil penalty based upon Respondent's self-report in the SCSD Initiative. If at any time following the entry of this Order, the Division obtains information indicating that Respondent knowingly provided materially false or misleading information or materials to the Commission, or in a related proceeding, the Division may, at its sole discretion and with prior notice to the Respondent, petition the Commission to reopen this matter and seek an order directing that the Respondent pay a civil money penalty. Respondent may contest by way of defense in any resulting administrative proceeding whether it knowingly provided materially false or misleading information, but may not: (1) contest the findings in this Order; or (2) assert any defense to liability or remedy, including, but not limited to, any statute of limitations defense.

E. Respondent shall comply with the undertakings enumerated in Section III, paragraphs 13.c through 13.e above.

By the Commission.

Vanessa A. Countryman  
Acting Secretary