

On September 9, 2019, Scott Shulman ("Mr. Shulman"), who resides at Juno Beach, FL submitted a Statement of Claim to the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority ("FINRA") Office of Dispute Resolution requesting a hearing for the expungement of his CRD record as it relates to customer dispute occurrence number 4789 ("the Occurrence"). On September 25, 2019, counsel for Mr. Shulman received notice that the Director of FINRA Office of Dispute Resolution ("the Director") denied FINRA forum for arbitration for expungement of the Occurrence. This notice stated the Occurrence arises from a "prior adverse award" and is not eligible for arbitration, citing Industry Code Rule 13203(a). However, Industry Code Rule 13203(a) does not state that occurrences arising from prior adverse awards are ineligible for FINRA arbitration. Rather, it states:

(a) The Director may decline to permit the use of the FINRA arbitration forum if the Director determines that, given the purposes of FINRA and the intent of the Code, the subject matter of the dispute is inappropriate, or that accepting the matter would pose a risk to the health or safety of arbitrators, staff, or parties or their representatives. Only the Director may exercise the authority under this Rule.

Industry Code Rule 13203(a) is excessively vague, and allows for an egregious amount of discretion on the part of the Director. It offers no true guidance on what is not eligible for FINRA

forum and allows for many inconsistencies. In fact, counsel for Mr. Shulman has represented other

Associated Persons in FINRA arbitration for expungement of disclosures arising from prior

adverse awards and has succeeded on the merits in at least one case. It is worth noting that FINRA

did file a Partial Opposition to the Motion to Confirm Arbitration Award in that case. However,

the case resulted in an Order for Confirmation of Arbitration Award, which was ordered on May

15, 2018. It is also important to note that in addition to no codified rule barring the arbitration for

expungement of disclosures arising from a prior adverse award, FINRA's Dispute Resolution

Expungement Training and Exam packet states that arbitrators "should not" grant expungement

for these types of occurrences. It does not state that they cannot grant expungement for these types

of occurrences and it stands to reason that there would be no need for guidance on whether they

should or should not be expunged from a CRD record if FINRA intended for these types of

occurrences to be ineligible for FINRA forum altogether. Based on Mr. Shulman's obligations to

abide by FINRA Rules, he is bound to FINRA arbitration for disputes between himself and a

Member Firm. The Director has abused their discretion by denying forum in such an inconsistent

and arbitrary manner.

Mr. Shulman submits this Application for Review to the Commission requesting that he

be permitted to bring his case in the forum that he is both entitled to and bound to by the FINRA

Industry Code Rules. Whether the Occurrence is eligible for expungement should be

subsequently determined by the Panel that is assigned in arbitration, in accordance with FINRA

Industry Code Rules 2080 and 13805.

Dated: October 2, 2019

Page 2 of 3

Respectfully submitted,

Frances Menzer, Esq. Of Counsel

T: (720) 223-7515

E: legal.menzer@hlbslaw.com

HLBS Law

9737 Wadsworth Pkwy, Ste. G-100 Westminster, CO 80021

SECURITIES EXCHANGE COMMISSION	
Denial of FINRA Forum for Expungement Arbitration:	
Applicant:	
Scott Shulman	
v.	FILE NO.
Respondent:	
Financial Industry Regulatory Authority	
NOTICE OF APPEARANCE FOR APPLICANT	

Please accept this as my notice of appearance for Applicant in the above captioned matter.

Dated: October 2, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

Frances Menzer, Esq.

Of Counsel

T: (720) 223-7515

E: <u>legal.menzer@hlbslaw.com</u>

HLBS Law

9737 Wadsworth Pkwy, Ste. G-100

Westminster, CO 80021

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Olivia Peterson, on October 2, 2019, served the original and three copies of Mr. Shulman's Application for Review and Notice of Appearance on:

Vanessa A. Countryman, Secretary Securities and Exchange Commission 100 F St., NE Room 10915 Washington, DC 20549-1090 Fax: 202-772-9324

- [X] (BY FAX) I caused the documents to be sent to the persons at the fax number listed above. I did not receive, within a reasonable time after the transmission, any electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful.
- [X] (BY MAIL) I caused the documents to be sent by US Certified Mail to the persons listed above. I did not receive notice or indication from the US Postal Service that the delivery would be unsuccessful.
- [X] (STATE) I certify (or declare) under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Colorado that the foregoing is true and correct.

On this date, I also served the original and three copies of Mr. Shulman's Application for Review and Notice of Appearance on:

Associate General Counsel FINRA 1735 K Street, NW Washington, DC 20006 Email: nac.casefilings@finra.org

- [X] (BY EMAIL) I caused the documents to be sent to the persons at the e-mail address listed above. I did not receive, within a reasonable time after the transmission, any electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful.
- [X] (BY MAIL) I caused the documents to be sent by US Certified Mail to the persons listed above. I did not receive notice or indication from the US Postal Service that the delivery would be unsuccessful.
- [X] (STATE) I certify (or declare) under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Colorado that the foregoing is true and correct.

Olivia Peterson

9737 Wadsworth Parkway, Suite G-100

Westminster, CO 80021