HARD COPY

OCT 18 2016
OFFICE OF THE SECRETARY

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA Before the SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION

200		200000000000000000000000000000000000000		50,000	-	 7	-		 1	***	-	
In	the l	Matte	er of	c,								

LYNN TILTON
PATRIARCH PARTNERS, LLC,
PATRIARCH PARTNERS VIII, LLC,
PATRIARCH PARTNERS XIV, LLC and
PATRIARCH PARTNERS XV, LLC

Respondents.

Administrative Proceeding File No. 3-16462

Judge Carol Fox Foelak

DECLARATION OF MARY BETH MALONEY IN SUPPORT OF RESPONDENTS' MOTION TO COMPEL THE OFFICE OF LITIGATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICE TO PRODUCE DOCUMENTS RESPONSIVE TO RESPONDENTS' SUBPOENAS

Mary Beth Maloney, deposes and states as follows:

- I am an associate in the law firm of Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP, attorneys for
 the above-referenced Respondents. I submit this declaration in support of Respondents'
 Memorandum of Law in Support of Their Motion to Compel the Office of Litigation and
 Administrative Practice to Produce Documents Responsive to Respondents' Subpoenas.
- Attached hereto as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of the Securities and Exchange Commission's letter to Your Honor, dated August 3, 2016.
- 3. Attached hereto as Exhibit 2 is a true and correct copy of "Privilege Log: In the Matter of Lynn Tilton, et al., AP File No. 3-16462," sent to Respondents October 14, 2016.

Dated: New York, NY October 17, 2016

Mary Beth Malone



UNITED STATES SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION

DENVER REGIONAL OFFICE 1961 STOUT STREET SUITE 1700 DENVER, COLORADO 80294-1961

DIVISION OF ENFORCEMENT

Direct Number: (303) 844.1041 Facsimile Number: (303) 297.3529

August 3, 2016

Via Email and Facsimile

Honorable Carol Fox Foelak U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission 100 F Street, NE Washington DC 25049

Re: In the Matter of Lynn Tilton, et al. (File No. 3-16462)

Dear Judge Foelak:

On July 27, 2016, Respondents submitted two requests for the issuance of subpoenas directed at the Securities and Exchange Commission. The first request was for a document subpoena primarily relating to the Commission's Amended Rules of Practice ("First Request"). The second request was for a document subpoena primarily relating to communications between the Commission and various other entities ("Second Request"). The Division of Enforcement respectfully submits this response to the Respondents' Second Request.

The Second Request is unreasonable, oppressive, excessive in scope, and unduly burdensome. See Rule of Prac. 232(b). Additionally, the subpoena requests information protected by the attorney client, attorney work-product, deliberative process, and law enforcement privileges, making it impermissible. For all of these reasons, the Division requests that the Court not issue the subpoena requested in the Second Request as drafted, and instead direct the Respondents to revise the subpoena to eliminate the requests for privileged and protected information.

Attorney-client communications are protected from disclosure. *United States v. Schwimmer*, 892 F.2d 237, 243 (2d Cir.1989) ("[The] communications between attorney and client endure as the oldest rule of privilege known to the common law."). Additionally, a number of Respondents' requests call for attorney notes made by the Division's attorneys. Attorney notes and memoranda of witness interviews are subject to heightened protection, amounting to "almost absolute immunity" from discovery and are "virtually undiscoverable." *In re Grand Jury Proceedings*, 492 F.3d 976, 981-982 (8th Cir. 2007); *Baker v. General Motors Corp.*, 209 F.2d 1051, 1054 (8th Cir. 2000); *In re Grand Jury Proceedings*, 43 F.3d 966, 970 (5th Cir. 1994),

¹ The Division understands that the Office of Litigation and Administrative Practice of the Office of the General Counsel is submitting a response to the Respondents' First Request, as well as to the Respondents' Second Request to the extent it is seeking documents from Commission divisions and offices beyond the Division of Enforcement.

Honorable Carol Fox Foelak August 3, 2016 Page 2

quoting Hickman v. Taylor, 329 U.S. 495, 512 (1947). As the Supreme Court stated in Upjohn Co. v. United States, 449 U.S. 383, 400 (1981), "work product [based on oral statements from third parties] cannot be disclosed simply on a showing of substantial need and inability to obtain the equivalent without undue hardship." Upjohn, 449 U.S. at 401. Courts have found that attorney notes of a witness interview "are opinion work product entitled to almost absolute immunity" on the basis that the notes reveal an attorney's legal conclusions because, when taking notes, an attorney often focuses on those facts that he or she deems legally significant. Baker, 209 F.2d at 1054.

Respondents' requests also ask for documents protected by the deliberative process privilege. "The deliberative process privilege applies to materials that are part and parcel of the process of internal agency decision making." N.L.R.B. v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132, 150 (1975). In order to secure protection under the deliberative process privilege, an agency must show that a document is both "predecisional" and "deliberative." Grand Cent. Partnership, Inc. v. Cuomo, 166 F.3d 473, 482 (2d Cir. 1999). Respondents' request calls for documents that are both predecisional (because they relate to the decision-making process related to this action against Respondents) and deliberative (because, again, they relate to the deliberation regarding the action against Respondents).

Further, several of Respondents' requests ask for information related to inter-agency dealings with regard to law enforcement. These requests fall squarely within the law-enforcement privilege, which protects documents that contain, as relevant here, "information pertaining to law enforcement techniques and procedures . . . [or] information that would seriously impair the ability of a law enforcement agency to conduct future investigations." In re The City of New York, 607 F.3d 923, 948 (2d Cir. 2010) (citations and quotations omitted). "Once the party asserting the privilege successfully shows that the privilege applies, the district court must balance the public interest in nondisclosure against the need of a particular litigant for access to the privileged information." Id. (citation and quotation omitted). "There is a strong presumption against lifting the privilege." Id. (citation and quotation omitted).

Respondents' requests regarding expert witness drafts and communications are also contrary to the parties' prior agreement – consistent with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure – that such materials would not be disclosed by either party. See Exh. 1 hereto.

In addition, the subpoena largely seeks nonpublic documents that have already been disclosed in the Division's withheld document list, which was produced to Respondents on August 7, 2015. See Exh. 2 hereto.

Finally, the Division will continue to comply with its *Brady* obligations and will provide any material exculpatory evidence to Respondents, further obviating the need for Respondents' subpoena.

For all of these reasons, the Division requests that the Court not issue the subpoena requested in the Second Request as drafted, and instead direct the Respondents to revise the subpoena to eliminate the requests for privileged and protected information. At a minimum, the

Honorable Carol Fox Foelak August 3, 2016 Page 3

Court should require the Respondents to demonstrate "the general relevance and reasonable scope of the ... evidence sought." Rule of Prac. 232(b). The Division is available for a hearing on this issue at the Court's convenience. Should the Court determine to issue the subpoena as drafted, or in a modified form, the Division reserves all rights to file an application to quash or modify the subpoena pursuant to Rule of Practice 232(e).

Sincerely,

Dugan Bliss

Senior Trial Counsel

cc via email: Randy Mastro, Esq. Lisa Rubin, Esq. Susan Brune, Esq.

Document	Document		Document					
Number	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
		Investigative						Work Product
	02/24/2012	Information	Email without		Willis Epps, contracting			Doctrine; Law
1	14:08 EST	Request	Attachment	YoungJae Chung, SEC	officer, U.S. Army	Brent Mitchell, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
					Policy and Statutory			Work Product
					Enforcement Unit, Office			Doctrine; Law
					of Enforcement			Enforcement Privilege;
	04/16/2012		Email with		Operations, Dep't of	N. Creola Kelly and Brent		Deliberative Process
2	16:35 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Stephen E. Jones, SEC	Justice	Mitchell, SEC		Privilege
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
								Enforcement Privilege;
	04/16/2012							Deliberative Process
3	16:35 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment					Privilege
								Work Product
				Robert De La Cruz, Policy and			1	Doctrine; Law
				Statutory Enforcement Unit,				Enforcement Privilege;
	04/27/2012		Email without	Office of Enforcement	N. Creola Kelly and Brent			Deliberative Process
4	4 11:16 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Operations, Dep't of Justice	Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
								Work Product
				Robert De La Cruz, Policy and				Doctrine; Law
				Statutory Enforcement Unit,				Enforcement Privilege;
	04/27/2012		Email without	Office of Enforcement				Deliberative Process
į	5 11:49 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Operations, Dep't of Justice	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
					Robert De La Cruz, Policy			
					and Statutory			Work Product
					Enforcement Unit, Office			Doctrine; Law
					of Enforcement			Enforcement Privilege
	04/27/2012		Email without		Operations, Dep't of	Stephen Jones and N.		Deliberative Process
(6 11:49 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Justice	Creola Kelly, SEC		Privilege

ocument	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					Robert De La Cruz, Policy			
				- 1 - 1	and Statutory			Work Product
					Enforcement Unit, Office			Doctrine; Law
					of Enforcement			Enforcement Privilege
	04/27/2012		Email without		Operations, Dep't of			Deliberative Process
7	13:15 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Justice	N. Creola Kelly, SEC		Privilege
								Work Product
			-	Robert De La Cruz, Policy and				Doctrine; Law
				Statutory Enforcement Unit,				Enforcement Privilege
	04/27/2012		Email without	Office of Enforcement				Deliberative Process
8	13:16 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Operations, Dep't of Justice	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
					Robert De La Cruz, Policy			
					and Statutory			Work Product
					Enforcement Unit, Office			Doctrine; Law
					of Enforcement			Enforcement Privilege
	04/27/2012		Email without		Operations, Dep't of			Deliberative Process
9	13:19 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Justice	N. Creola Kelly, SEC		Privilege
						Tina Barber, Angela Coit,		
						Sheila Franklin, and		
						Debora Morris, Policy		
						and Statutory		Work Product
				Robert De La Cruz, Policy and		Enforcement Unit,		Doctrine; Law
				Statutory Enforcement Unit,		Office of Enforcement		Enforcement Privilege
	04/30/2012		Email with	Office of Enforcement		Operations, Dep't of		Deliberative Process
10	09:33 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment	Operations, Dep't of Justice	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Justice		Privilege
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
								Enforcement Privilege
	04/30/2012							Deliberative Process
13	1 09:33 EDT	Immunity Request	Attachment					Privilege

2

Document	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
		Investigative		Norma Fontana, AUSA, U.S.				Work Product
	07/16/2012	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, District of		Amanda DeRoo and N.		Doctrine; Law
12	13:03 EDT	Request	Attachment	Arizona	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Creola Kelly, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	04/04/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
13	18:11 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			Work Product
					Defense Criminal			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Enforcement Privilege
	04/04/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,	1		Deliberative Process
14	18:30 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Allison Lee, SEC		Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			Work Product
					Defense Criminal			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Enforcement Privilege
	04/04/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Deliberative Process
15	18:32 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Allison Lee, SEC		Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			Work Product
					Defense Criminal			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Enforcement Privilege
	04/05/2013	Information	Email with		Huntsville Post of Duty,	N. Creola Kelly and		Deliberative Process
16	16:38 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Allison Lee, SEC		Privilege
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
		Investigative		-				Enforcement Privilege
	04/05/2013	Information		1				Deliberative Process
17	16:38 EDT	Request	Attachment					Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			Work Product
					Defense Criminal			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative		2	Investigative Service,			Enforcement Privilege
	04/05/2013		Email with		Huntsville Post of Duty,	N. Creola Kelly and		Deliberative Process
18		Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Allison Lee, SEC	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Privilege

3

ocument	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
		Investigative						Enforcement Privilege;
	04/05/2013	Information						Deliberative Process
19	16:38 EDT	Request	Attachment			1		Privilege
								Work Product
	1			SA Lance Stamper, Defense				Doctrine; Law
	1	Investigative	1	Criminal Investigative Service,				Enforcement Privilege;
	04/08/2013	Information	Email with	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Deliberative Process
20	12:33 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
		Investigative						Work Product
	04/08/2013	Information					4	Doctrine; Law
21	12:33 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	04/08/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
22	12:33 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			Work Product
					Defense Criminal			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Enforcement Privilege
	04/09/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Deliberative Process
23	21:40 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	04/10/2013		Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
24	16:51 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense	7 7 7 7			
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	04/10/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
25	5 16:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege

Document	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
26	04/10/2013	Investigative Information Request	Email without Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
	04/10/2013	Investigative	Email without	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
	04/11/2013 3 14:09 EDT	Investigative	Email with	Brent Mitchell, SEC	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Gina Blow, SEC		Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege Deliberative Process Privilege
	04/11/2013 9 14:09 EDT	Investigative	Attachment					Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege Deliberative Process Privilege
30	04/18/2013 08:24 EDT	Investigative Information Request	Email without Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	N. Creola Kelly, Allison Lee, Laura Metcalfe, and Reid Muoio, SEC		Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privileg
31	04/18/2013 1 10:25 EDT	Investigative Information Request	Email without Attachment	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privileg
32	04/24/2013 2 15:47 EDT	Investigative Information Request	Email without Attachment	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privileg

Document	Document		Document					
Number	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	04/24/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
33	16:28 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	04/24/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
34	16:29 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
				1	Defense Criminal			
		Investigative		1	Investigative Service,			Work Product
	04/24/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
35	16:31 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege
								Work Product
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				Doctrine; Law
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Enforcement Privilege
	06/03/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,			4	Deliberative Process
36	10:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
								Work Product
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				Doctrine; Law
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,		1		Enforcement Privilege
	06/07/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Deliberative Process
37	7 09:41 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal		1	
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	06/07/2013		Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
38	8 10:24 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege

Document Number	Document Date	Subject	Document Type	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
	06/07/2013	Investigative	Email without Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Linan cc	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
40	06/07/2013 11:27 EDT	Investigative Information Request	Email without Attachment	SA Lance Stamper, Defense Criminal Investigative Service, Huntsville Post of Duty, Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
41	06/21/2013	Investigative Information Request	Calendar Entry	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Pat Meadows, AUSA, U.S. Attorney's Office, Northern District of Alabama			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
42	06/25/2013	Investigative Information Request	Calendar Entry	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Pat Meadows, AUSA, U.S. Attorney's Office, Northern District of Alabama			Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege
43	07/08/2013 3 10:06 EDT	Investigative Information Request	Email with	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Ramona Albin, AUSA, U.S. Attorney's Office, Northern District of Alabama	N. Creola Kelly, Allison Lee, Laura Metcalfe, Reid Muoio, and John Smith, SEC	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege Deliberative Process Privilege
	07/08/2013 4 10:06 EDT	Investigative	Attachment					Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege Deliberative Process Privilege
		Investigative Information Request	Email with Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Ramona Albin, AUSA, U.S. Attorney's Office, Northern District of Alabama	N. Creola Kelly, Allison Lee, Laura Metcalfe, Reid Muoio, and John Smith, SEC		Work Product Doctrine; Law Enforcement Privilege Deliberative Process Privilege

Document	Document		Document					
Number	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
								Work Product
							712 1	Doctrine; Law
		Investigative		1 1				Enforcement Privilege
	07/08/2013	Information						Deliberative Process
46	10:06 EDT	Request	Attachment					Privilege
		Investigative		Ramona Albin, AUSA, U.S.				Work Product
	07/08/2013	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Northern				Doctrine; Law
47	11:30 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of Alabama	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	08/22/2013	Information	Email with	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
48	15:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative						Work Product
	08/22/2013	Information						Doctrine; Law
49	15:53 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
			1		Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	08/22/2013		Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,	CALLY YE CHARLE		Doctrine; Law
50	15:59 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Allison Lee, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	08/26/2013		Email with	Huntsville Post of Duty,		1		Doctrine; Law
51	12:43 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative						Work Product
	08/26/2013							Doctrine; Law
52	12:43 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege
	00/05/05	Investigative						Work Product
	08/26/2013							Doctrine; Law
53	12:43 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege

Document	Document		Document					
Number	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
54	14:25 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
55	14:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,	1 5		Doctrine; Law
56	14:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Amy Sumner, SEC	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
57	14:53 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Amy Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal		4	
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
58	14:55 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Amy Sumner, SEC	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal		4	
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	10/31/2013	Information			Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
59	14:55 EDT	Request	Calendar Entry	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege

9

Ocument	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	10/31/2013		Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
60	14:55 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Amy Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	11/01/2013		Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
61	13:12 EDT	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
						SA Lance Stamper,		
						Defense Criminal		
		Investigative				Investigative Service,		Work Product
	11/01/2013	Information	Email without			Huntsville Post of Duty,		Doctrine; Law
62	13:14 EDT	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Amy Sumner, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL		Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,		4		Work Product
	11/12/2013	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
63	17:38 EST	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal		1	
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	11/12/2013	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
64	4 20:00 EST	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege
				SA Lance Stamper, Defense				
		Investigative		Criminal Investigative Service,				Work Product
	01/23/2014	Information	Email without	Huntsville Post of Duty,				Doctrine; Law
65	5 13:50 EST	Request	Attachment	Redstone Arsenal, AL	Brent Mitchell, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					SA Lance Stamper,			
					Defense Criminal			
		Investigative			Investigative Service,			Work Product
	01/23/2014	Information	Email without		Huntsville Post of Duty,			Doctrine; Law
6	6 14:00 EST	Request	Attachment	Brent Mitchell, SEC	Redstone Arsenal, AL			Enforcement Privilege

10

Document	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					Katherine Goldstein,			
		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's			Work Product
	04/23/2015	Information	Email without		Office, Southern District of			Doctrine; Law
67	12:05 EDT	Request	Attachment	Dugan Bliss, SEC	New York			Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Work Product
	04/23/2015		Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,				Doctrine; Law
	12:06 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					Katherine Goldstein,			
4		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's			Work Product
	04/23/2015		Email without		Office, Southern District of			Doctrine; Law
	12:40 EDT	Request	Attachment	Michael Osnato, SEC	New York			Enforcement Privilege
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
	4	Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Enforcement Privileg
	04/23/2015		Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,				Deliberative Process
		Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Michael Osnato, SEC			Privilege
						Christopher Frey and		Work Product
				L		Telemachus Kasulis,	1	Doctrine; Law
	1	Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,		AUSAs, U.S. Attorney's		Enforcement Privilege
	04/23/2015	Information	Email with	U.S. Attorney's Office,		Office, Southern District		Deliberative Process
71	17:03 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Michael Osnato, SEC	of New York		Privilege
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
		Investigative						Enforcement Privilege
	04/23/2015	Information		1				Deliberative Process
72	17:03 EDT	Request	Attachment					Privilege
								Work Product
					Katherine Goldstein,			Doctrine; Law
		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's	Laura Metcalfe, Michael		Enforcement Privilege
	04/24/2015	Information	Email with		Office, Southern District of	Osnato, and Amy		Deliberative Process
73	15:07 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Lam, SEC	New York	Sumner, SEC		Privilege

Document	Document		Document					
umber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
								Work Product
								Doctrine; Law
		Investigative						Enforcement Privilege
	04/24/2015	Information						Deliberative Process
74	15:07 EDT	Request	Attachment					Privilege
				CPT Eric M. Liddick, Attorney-				
				Advisor, Procurement Fraud				
				Branch, Contract and Fiscal				
		Investigative		Law Division, U.S. Army Legal				Work Product
	04/27/2015	_	Email without	Services Agency, Fort Belvoir,				Doctrine; Law
75		Request	Attachment	VA	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
				CPT Eric M. Liddick, Attorney-				
				Advisor, Procurement Fraud				
				Branch, Contract and Fiscal				1
	1	Investigative		Law Division, U.S. Army Legal		1		Work Product
	04/27/2015	Information	Email with	Services Agency, Fort Belvoir,				Doctrine; Law
76	10:06 EDT	Request	Attachment	VA	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative						Work Product
	04/27/2015	Information						Doctrine; Law
77	7 10:06 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege
					CPT Eric M. Liddick,			
					Attorney-Advisor,	1		
					Procurement Fraud			1
					Branch, Contract and Fisca	1		
		Investigative			Law Division, U.S. Army			Work Product
	04/27/2015		Email without		Legal Services Agency, Fort	t		Doctrine; Law
78	8 10:09 EDT	Request	Attachment	Dugan Bliss, SEC	Belvoir, VA			Enforcement Privilege

ocument	Document		Document					
umber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					CPT Eric M. Liddick,			
					Attorney-Advisor,			
					Procurement Fraud			
					Branch, Contract and Fiscal			
		Investigative			Law Division, U.S. Army			Work Product
	04/27/2015	Information	Email without		Legal Services Agency, Fort			Doctrine; Law
79	10:09 EDT	Request	Attachment	Dugan Bliss, SEC	Belvoir, VA			Enforcement Privilege
				CPT Eric M. Liddick, Attorney-				
				Advisor, Procurement Fraud				1
				Branch, Contract and Fiscal				
		Investigative	1	Law Division, U.S. Army Legal				Work Product
	04/27/2015		Email with	Services Agency, Fort Belvoir,				Doctrine; Law
80	10:10 EDT	Request	Attachment	VA	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative						Work Product
	04/27/2015	Information						Doctrine; Law
81	10:10 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privilege
				CPT Eric M. Liddick, Attorney-				
	1			Advisor, Procurement Fraud				1
	1			Branch, Contract and Fiscal				
		Investigative		Law Division, U.S. Army Legal				Work Product
	04/27/2015	A STATE OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR	Email without	Services Agency, Fort Belvoir,				Doctrine; Law
82	10:10 EDT	Request	Attachment	VA	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privilego
		Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Work Product
	04/28/2015		Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,				Doctrine; Law
83	3 12:11 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Dugan Bliss, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Work Product
	04/29/2015		Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,				Doctrine; Law
84	13:10 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Michael Osnato, SEC			Enforcement Privileg

ocument	Document		Document					
umber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					Katherine Goldstein,			
		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's			Work Product
	04/29/2015	Information	Email without		Office, Southern District of			Doctrine; Law
85	13:15 EDT	Request	Attachment	Michael Osnato, SEC	New York			Enforcement Privileg
					Katherine Goldstein,			
		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's			Work Product
	04/29/2015	Information	Email without		Office, Southern District of			Doctrine; Law
86	13:15 EDT	Request	Attachment	Michael Osnato, SEC	New York			Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Work Product
	04/29/2015		Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,				Doctrine; Law
	13:18 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Michael Ocnato SEC			
0/	13.16 EU1	request	Attacimient	Southern district of New York	Katherine Goldstein,			Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative			AUSA, U.S. Attorney's			Work Product
	04/29/2015	Information	Email without	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Office, Southern District of		i	Doctrine; Law
	15:49 EDT	Request	Attachment	Specialist, SEC	New York	Amy Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privileg
- 00	13.43 EUI	Request	Attaciment	Specialist, Sec	New Tork	Alliy Sulliner, SEC		Emorcement Privileg
		Investigative		Katherine Goldstein, AUSA,				Work Product
	04/30/2015	Information	Email without	U.S. Attorney's Office,	Judy Bizu, Paralegal			Doctrine; Law
89	13:18 EDT	Request	Attachment	Southern District of New York	Specialist, SEC	Amy Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privileg
						Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	05/11/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern		Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
90	18:03 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC	York		Enforcement Privileg
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,	Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,	U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	05/12/2015	Information	Email without	1	Southern District of New	Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
91	09:41 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York	York		Enforcement Privileg
						Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	05/12/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern		Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
92	12:40 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC	York		Enforcement Privileg

Document	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,	Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,	U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	05/12/2015	Information	Email without		Southern District of New	Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
93	13:09 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York	York		Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,	Dugan Bliss, Nicole		Work Product
	05/20/2015	Information	Email without	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Southern District of New	Nesvig, and Amy		Doctrine; Law
94	17:41 EDT	Request	Attachment	Specialist, SEC	York	Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	05/20/2015	Information	Email without	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Southern District of New	Dugan Bliss and Amy		Doctrine; Law
95	17:41 EDT	Request	Attachment	Specialist, SEC	York	Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		Dugan Bliss, Nicole		Work Product
	05/20/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Nesvig, and Amy		Doctrine; Law
96	17:43 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Specialist, SEC	Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	05/29/2015	Information	Email without	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Southern District of New	Dugan Bliss and Amy		Doctrine; Law
97	13:00 EDT	Request	Attachment	Specialist, SEC	York	Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.				Work Product
	05/29/2015		Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern	Judy Bizu, Paralegal	Dugan Bliss and Amy		Doctrine; Law
98	13:43 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Specialist, SEC	Sumner, SEC		Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	06/09/2015		Email without		Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
99	13:52 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York			Enforcement Privilege
						Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	06/09/2015		Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern		Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
100	13:52 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC	York		Enforcement Privilege

Document	Document		Document					
lumber	Date	Subject	Туре	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	06/09/2015	Information	Email with		Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
101	17:04 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York			Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative						Work Product
	06/09/2015	Information						Doctrine; Law
102	17:04 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative						Work Product
	06/09/2015	Information						Doctrine; Law
103	17:04 EDT	Request	Attachment					Enforcement Privileg
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.				Work Product
	06/09/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern				Doctrine; Law
104	17:08 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC			Enforcement Privileg
						Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	06/16/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern		Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
105	12:00 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC	York		Enforcement Privileg
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,	Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,	U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	06/16/2015	Information	Email without		Southern District of New	Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
106	12:04 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York	York		Enforcement Privileg
						Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative		Christopher Frey, AUSA, U.S.		U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	06/16/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern		Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
107	12:05 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	Amy Sumner, SEC	York		Enforcement Privileg
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,	Daniel Goldman, AUSA,		
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,	U.S. Attorney's Office,		Work Product
	06/18/2015	Information	Email without		Southern District of New	Southern District of New		Doctrine; Law
108	15:08 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York	York		Enforcement Privileg

16

	Document Date	Subject	Document Type	Email From	Email To	Email CC	Email BCC	Privilege(s)
				And A section of the	Christopher Frey and			
					Daniel Goldman, AUSAs,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	06/30/2015	Information	Email without		Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
109	16:54 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York			Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
		Investigative		Daniel Goldman, AUSA, U.S.	U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	06/30/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern	Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
110	17:10 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	York; Amy Sumner, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey, AUSA,			
	1	Investigative		Daniel Goldman, AUSA, U.S.	U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	07/27/2015	Information	Email without	Attorney's Office, Southern	Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
111	18:10 EDT	Request	Attachment	District of New York	York; Amy Sumner, SEC			Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey and			
					Daniel Goldman, AUSAs,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	07/28/2015	Information	Email without		Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
112	09:55 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York			Enforcement Privilege
					Christopher Frey and			
					Daniel Goldman, AUSAs,			
		Investigative			U.S. Attorney's Office,			Work Product
	6 20	Information	Email without		Southern District of New			Doctrine; Law
113	10:01 EDT	Request	Attachment	Amy Sumner, SEC	York			Enforcement Privilege