## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA <br> Before the <br> SECURITIES AND EXCHANGE COMMISSION

## ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDING

File No. 3-15514
In the Matter of
DONALD J. ANTHONY, JR., FRANK H. CIAPPONE, RICHARD D. FELDMANN, WILLIAM P. GAMELLO, ANDREW G. GUZZETTI, WILLIAM F. LEX, THOMAS E. LIVINGSTON, BRIAN T. MAYER, PHILIP S. RABINOVICH, and RYAN C. ROGERS,

## Respondents.

## RESPONDENT THOMAS LIVINGSTON'S MOTION TO CORRECT THE INITIAL DECISION

Pursuant to Rule 410, Respondent Thomas Livingston ("Livingston") respectfully submits this Motion to Correct the Initial Decision because there was a manifest error of fact in the disgorgement ordered therein. The Initial Decision ordered Livingston to disgorge commissions on all sales of the Four Funds and the McGinn Smith Trusts at issue in the case made after February 1, 2008 and ordered him to disgorge $\$ 1,120$. There is no evidence, however, that the $\$ 1,120$ paid to Livingston after February 1, 2008 related to sales of the Four Funds or the McGinn Smith Trusts and, therefore, the disgorgement ordered was a manifest error of fact. ${ }^{1}$

The Respondents were ordered to "disgorge all commissions earned on sales after" February 1, 2008. Initial Decision at 115. Relying on Div. Ex. 2, Ex. 4n (SEC Accountant Palen's

[^0]Declaration), Livingston was ordered to disgorge $\$ 1,120$, which represents the total of the only two commission payments shown paid to Livingston after February 1, 2008. Id. Exhibit 4n to Palen's Declaration lists two payments to Livingston after February 1, 2008: (1) $\$ 420$ on February 15, 2008 for "Annual FEIN, tain \& fiin" [sic] and (2) $\$ 700$ on February 15,2009 for "Net Private (TDMM Cable 09)".

First, according to Exhibit 4m to Palen's Declaration, Livingston's last sale of one of the Four Funds was on January 9, 2007. Div. Ex. 2 at Ex. 4m. Therefore, the payment of $\$ 420$ on February 15, 2008 for "Annual FEIN, tain \& fiin" could not have been for sales of any of those Four Funds that occurred after February 1, 2008. Accordingly, disgorgement of a $\$ 420$ payment on February 15, 2008 is inconsistent with the Initial Decision's finding that disgorgement should be for sales occurring after February 1, 2008 and it should be reversed.

Second, with regard to the $\$ 700$ payment on February 15,2009 , there is no evidence that payment related to the sale of TDMM Cable 09. Indeed, the parenthetical of "TDMM Cable 09" included in Ms. Palen's Declaration is nothing more than her unsupported speculation of what that payment related to. In discussing her review of bi-monthly schedules, Ms. Palen testified: "Some of the time there were very detailed line items that would specify what product the commissions were being paid for, and other times it was lumped into a line that was called 'private placement' or 'net proprietary' or some other kind of description that indicated it was private placement-type commissions." Tr. at 230, 11-18, attached hereto as Exhibit "A". Here, it is clear that Ms. Palen took an unspecified payment and assumed it related to the sale of TDMM Cable. Regardless, the Division did not offer any evidence to support Ms. Palen's characterization of the $\$ 700$ payment.

In reviewing the bi-monthly schedule that Palen used for her entry for the payment on February 15,2009 , it reveals that there is no indication that payment was for a sale of TDMM Cable 09. See Liv. Ex. 126 (last page), attached hereto as Exhibit "B." Indeed, the bi-monthly schedule
states the $\$ 700$ was for "Net Private $70 \%$." Id. The Division offered no testimony on what the Net Private $70 \%$ line item represented in the McGinn Smith bi-monthly schedules. Further, on the same schedule, there are three separate line items for TDM notes. Id. If the $\$ 700$ related to the sale of a TDM note, it follows that the payment would have been listed under one of those three lines reserved for TDM note commissions. But, there are no payments to Livingston listed in any of those lines. Disgorgement of the $\$ 700$ cannot be based on Ms. Palen's unsupported speculation that the payment classified under "Net Private $70 \%$ " related to a sale of a TDM note. The Division offered no admissible evidence whatsoever to support that belief.

For all these reasons, Livingston respectfully requests that his Motion to Correct the Initial Decision be granted, that the order of disgorgement be reversed, and that he be granted to such further relief to which he is entitled.

Dated: March 6, 2015


ATTORNEYS FOR RESPONDENT THOMAS LIVINGSTON

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the date set forth below, I filed the foregoing pleading with the Office of the Secretary of the Commission via facsimile at (202) 772-9324, and served copies on the following persons via regular mail and email, except where otherwise indicated.

David Stoelting, Esquire
Haimavathi V. Marlier, Esquire
Michael D. Birnbaum, Esquire
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission

Division of Enforcement
Three World Financial Center
New York, NY 10281
stoeltingd@sec.gov
marlierh@sec.gov
birnbaumm@sec.gov
Roland M. Cavalier, Esquire
Tuczinski, Cavalier \& Gilchrist, P.C.
54 State Street
Suite 803
Albany, NY 12207
RCavalier@tcglegal.com

Counsel for Respondent Frank H. Chiappone
Loren Schechter, Esquire
Duane Morris LLP
1540 Broadway
New York, NY 10036
LSchechter@duanemorris.com
Counsel for Respondent William P. Gamello
Gilbert B. Abramson, Esquire
One Presidential Boulevard, Suite 315
Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004
(610) 664-5700
(610) 664-5770 (Fax)
gabramson@gbalaw.com
Counsel for Respondent William F. Lex

Hon. Cameron J. Elliot
Administrative Law Judge
Securities and Exchange Commission
100 F Street, NE
Washington, D.C. 20545-2557
alj@sec.gov

Sean T. Haran, Esquire
Laura Seamon, Esquire
Nixon Peabody
437 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10022
sharan@nixonpeabody.com
Iseamon@nixonpeabody.com
Counsel for Respondent Richard D. Feldman
Mark J. Astarita, Esquire
Sallah, Astarita \& Cox LLC
60 Pompton Avenue
Verona, NJ 07044
mja@sallahlaw.com
Counsel for Respondent Andrew G. Guzzetti
M. William Munno, Esquire

Brian P. Maloney, Esquire
Seward \& Kissell LLP
One Battery Park Plaza
New York, NY 10004
munno@sewkis.com
maloney@sewkis.com
Counsel for Respondent Philip S. Rabvinovich, Bryan T. Mayer and Ryan C. Rogers

Mr. Donald J. Anthony, Jr. (pro se)
7 Glen Avenue
2nd Floor
Troy, NY 12180

Date: March 6,2015


Matthew G. Nielsen

## EXHIBIT A



## EXHIBIT B



Page 4 of 6

## Livingston Exhibit <br> 126

File No. 3-15514


Split 425
$\begin{array}{ll}350 & 503.1\end{array}$

Paga 4 of 6

## Pay Date:8/45/07

| Rep\# <br> Name <br> CostCenter | $\begin{gathered} 900 \\ \text { Tom Livingston } \\ 0 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 150 \\ \text { James Rutherford } \\ 200 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 310 \\ & \text { Bill Gamello } \\ & 200 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 460 \\ \text { Pleter VanDerzee } \\ 200 \end{gathered}$ | 645 Frank Chlappone 200 | $\begin{gathered} 734 \\ \text { Carl Nicolosi } \\ 200 \end{gathered}$ | 735 Dick Feldmann 200 | $\begin{gathered} 789 \\ \text { Don Anthony } \\ 200 \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gross Advisory |  |  |  |  | 233.25 |  |  | 509.09 |
| Gross Equity | 375.00 | 4,581.17 | 15,512.42 | 12,611.37 | 5,399.09 |  | 277.82 | 19,975.94 |
| Gross Mutual Funds | 80.52 | 72.63 | 556.67 | 288.02 | 15,709.60 | 4,045.89 | 1,284.04 | 5,470.21 |
| Gross Product |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Gross Private |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Firstline | 2,500.00 |  |  |  | 1,250.00 |  |  |  |
| Investment Banking |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total Gross | 2,955.52 | 4,653.80 | 16,069.09 | 12,899.39 | 22,591.94 | 4,045.89 | 1,561.86 | 25,955.24 |
| Net Advisory | - | - | - | $\cdots$ | 139.95 | - |  | 305.45 |
| Net Equity | 168.75 | 1,603.41 | 6,980.59 | 4,413.98 | 2,699.55 | $\cdot$ | 125.02 | 8,887.97 |
| Net Mutual Funds | 32.21 | 29.05 | 278.34 | 115.21 | 8,640.28 | 2,427.53 | 642.02 | 3,008.62 |
| Net Product | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Net Private | - | - | - | - | - | - |  |  |
| Firstline | 2,000.00 | - | - | - | 1,000.00 | $\bigcirc \quad-$ | - | . |
| Investment Banking |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Overide |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| TotaiNet | 2,200.96 | 1,632.46 | 7,258.92 | 4,529.19 | 12,479.78 | 2,427.53 | 767.04 | 13,302.04 |
| Internet | 12.50 |  |  | 12.50 | 12.50 |  | 12.50 | 12.50 |
| Parking |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Services |  |  |  |  | 706.75 |  |  | 118:75 |
| Other Charges-overnight | 10,787.31 |  | 100.00 |  |  |  |  |  |
| Errors |  | 57.08 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Comm Rev to Sales Asst |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total Charges | 10,799.81 | 57.08 | 100.00 | 12.50 | 719.25 | - | 12.50 | 131.25 |
| Previous Balance Due | (47,410.38) | 11,933.00 | - | - | - | - | - | ${ }^{-}$ |
| Draw- Prior Month | 14,000.00 | - | 2,500.00 | 1,200.00 | 2,000.00 | - | 500.00 | 6,000.00 |
| EE owes MGS | (33.410.38) | 11,933.00 | 2,500.00 | 1,200.00 | 2,000.00 | - | 500.00 | 6,000.00 |
| Total Due Employee | $(8,598.85)$ | 1,575.38 | 7,158.92 | 4,516.69 | 11,760.53 | 2,427.53 | 762.28 | 13,170.79 |
| Pay 15th |  |  | 4,658.92 | 3,316.69 | 9,760.53 | 2,427.53 | 262.28 | 7,170.79 |
| Due to MGS |  | Wherex | - | - | - - | - | - | - |
| Payout on 15th | - | $\because \because 577500$ | 4,659:00 | \%-3,317.00 | : $\because:{ }^{\prime} 9$ | 2.428000 | 26200 | 7,171:00 |
|  |  | FYI -Payroll deductions are $\$ 1,383.86$ |  |  |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Includes all Rep } \\ & \text { \#'s } 425 \end{aligned}$ |  |
|  | Payroll deduction to add Car lease for Other charges Dec/06 is $\$ 996$ Feb/07 is $\$ 24$ \$1344.85, | for Livingston-Need ince Sept/06 Notes 10,787.31 = \{Sept$.04 \times 4=3984.16$, 0.18, March is April-June is |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| . | $996.04 \times 3=\$ 2988$. last pym | 2) June/07 was the MGS paid |  |  |  |  | 8/910 | 2007 |
|  |  |  | Pag | 6 of 7 |  |  |  | 1 PM |










[^0]:    I This Motion is made subject to and without waiver of Livingston's rights to challenge other errors of fact and law through a petition for review to the Commission and he reserves all of his rights with regard thereto.

