

# CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

ONE LIBERTY PLAZA  
NEW YORK, NY 10006-1470  
(212) 225-2000  
FACSIMILE (212) 225-3999  
WWW.CLEARYGOTTLIEB.COM

WASHINGTON, DC • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON  
MOSCOW • FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN  
HONG KONG • BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO

Writer's Direct Dial: +1 212 225 2262  
E-Mail: [daman@cgsh.com](mailto:daman@cgsh.com)

LESLIE B. SAMUELS  
EVAN A. DAVIS  
LAURENT ALPERT  
VICTOR I. LEWKOW  
LESLIE N. SILVERMAN  
ROBERT L. TORTORIELLO  
A. RICHARD SUSKO  
LEE C. BUCHHEIT  
JAMES M. PEASLEE  
ALAN L. BELLER  
THOMAS J. MOLONEY  
WILLIAM F. GORIN  
MICHAEL L. RYAN  
ROBERT P. DAVIS  
YARON Z. REICH  
RICHARD S. LINCER  
JAIME A. EL KOURY  
STEVEN G. HOROWITZ  
ANDREA G. PODOLSKY  
JAMES A. DUNCAN  
STEVEN M. LOEB  
DONALD A. STERN  
CRAIG B. BROD  
SHELDON H. ALSTER  
WANDA J. OLSON  
MITCHELL A. LOWENTHAL  
EDWARD J. ROSEN  
JOHN FALENBERG  
LAWRENCE B. FRIEDMAN  
NICOLAS GRABAR  
CHRISTOPHER E. AUSTIN  
SETH GROSSHANDLER  
WILLIAM A. GROLL  
JANET L. FISHER  
DAVID L. SUGERMAN  
HOWARD S. ZELBO  
DAVID E. BRODSKY  
MICHAEL R. LAZERWITZ  
ARTHUR H. KOHN  
RAYMOND B. CHECK

RICHARD J. COOPER  
JEFFREY S. LEWIS  
FILIP MOERMAN  
PAUL J. SHIM  
STEVEN L. WILNER  
ERIKA W. NIJENHUIS  
LINDSEE P. GRANFIELD  
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ  
DAVID C. LOPEZ  
CARMEN A. CORRALES  
JAMES L. BROWLEY  
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG  
LEWIS J. LIMAN  
LEV L. DASSIN  
NEIL Q. WHORISKEY  
JORGE U. JUANTORENA  
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER  
DAVID LEINWAND  
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL  
ETHAN A. KLINGBERG  
MICHAEL J. VOLKOVITSCH  
MICHAEL D. DAYAN  
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.  
JEFFREY D. KARFF  
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW  
ROBERT J. RAYMOND  
LEONARD C. JACOBY  
SANDRA L. FLOW  
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO  
WILLIAM L. MCRAE  
JASON FACTOR  
MARGARET S. PEPOINIS  
LISA M. SCHWEITZER  
KRISTOFER W. HESS  
JUAN G. GIRÁLDEZ  
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN  
BREON S. PEACE  
MEREDITH E. KOTLER  
CHANTAL E. KORDULA

BENET J. O'REILLY  
DAVID AMAN  
ADAM E. FLEISHER  
SEAN A. O'NEAL  
GLENN P. MOGRORY  
CHRISTOPHER P. MOORE  
JOON H. KIM  
MATTHEW P. SALERNO  
MICHAEL J. ALBANO  
VICTOR L. HOU  
ROGER A. COOPER  
AMY R. SHAPIRO  
JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK  
RESIDENT PARTNERS

SANDRA M. ROCKS  
S. DOUGLAS BORISKY  
JUDITH KASSEL  
DAVID E. WEBB  
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU  
BOAZ S. MORAG  
MARY E. ALCOCK  
DAVID H. HERRINGTON  
HEIDE H. ILGENFRITZ  
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER  
HUGH C. CONROY, JR.  
KATHLEEN M. EMBERGER  
WALLACE L. LARSON, JR.  
JAMES D. SMALL  
AVRAM E. LUFT  
ELIZABETH LENAS  
DANIEL ILAN  
CARLO DE VITO PISCICELLI  
ANDREW WEAVER  
HELENA K. GRANNIS  
GRANT M. BINDER  
RESIDENT COUNSEL

June 27, 2012

BY ELECTRONIC MAIL TO RULE-COMMENTS@SEC.GOV

Ms. Elizabeth M. Murphy  
Secretary  
Securities and Exchange Commission  
100 F Street, NE  
Washington, DC 20549-1090

Re: File No. SR-FINRA-2012-024

Dear Ms. Murphy:

I thank FINRA and the Commission for this opportunity to comment on FINRA's proposed amendments to its Rule 4210 (the "Proposed Amendments"). I generally support the amendments included in FINRA's rule filing dated 5/23/2012 (the "Rule Filing"), especially the modernization of the treatment of option spread strategies. I believe, however, that the consequences of the proposed changes to the margin requirements for "non-margin eligible, non-equity securities" have not been fully considered. I recommend that FINRA investigate the extent to which FINRA members presently extend credit against these securities and withdraw or modify this element of the proposed amendments. I also have some technical comments on the drafting of the Proposed Amendments.

### Non-Margin Eligible, Non-Equity Securities.

According to the Rule Filing, FINRA proposes to increase the margin requirement applicable to long positions in "non-margin eligible, non-equity securities" to 100% (Rule Filing,

p.10, n.15) from the 25% requirement that currently applies under Rule 4210(c)(1).<sup>1</sup> The securities that would become unmarginable (*i.e.*, securities on which FINRA members would not be able to extend any credit) under the Proposed Amendments include any non-investment grade debt securities that are not registered under Section 5 of the Securities Act.<sup>2</sup> Since the high yield debt market is to a great proportion an institutional market, where it is usual for debt to trade under Rule 144A, the Proposed Amendments would cut off credit to a substantial part of the high yield debt market. This could have significant adverse effects on FINRA members, investors and issuers. At the very least, this amendment should not be made until after FINRA has investigated the extent of the credit that FINRA members currently provide to this market and the likely impact of withdrawing this credit from the market.

In addition to considering the economic effects of making these securities unmarginable, FINRA should review the reasons for taking such a step. If the concern is the liquidity of these securities, and the FINRA members' ability to liquidate customer long positions, then FINRA should consider the fact that the Commission permits broker-dealers to treat some of these securities as having a "ready market" for purposes of the Commission's Net Capital Rule. *See* FINRA Interp. SEA Rule 15c3-1(c)(2)(vii) /10 and /11. If the concern is the potential volatility of positions in these securities, then FINRA should consider whether the margin requirement on short positions in these securities could also apply to long positions.

#### Technical Comments

To impose a 100% maintenance margin requirement on non-margin eligible equity securities (and, if my recommendations above are not followed, non-margin eligible non-equity securities), FINRA should revise Rule 4210(c) to add a new subsection that sets that requirement. Although the Proposed Amendment would limit Rule 4210(c)(1) to margin equity securities, that is not sufficient to impose a 100% margin requirement on the securities not covered by Rule 4210(c). Also, since Rule 4210(e)(2)(A), (B) and (C) are no longer functioning as exceptions to Rule 4210(c), the structure of the rule would be simplified if these margin requirements for non-equity securities were moved from Rule 4210(e) into Rule 4210(c).

---

<sup>1</sup> Although FINRA is also proposing to apply a 100% margin requirement to non-margin eligible equity securities, the change to the treatment of non-equity securities is much greater. Non-margin eligible equity securities are already subject to a 100% initial margin requirement under Regulation T, so the Proposed Amendments only affect their use to meet maintenance margin requirements and margin requirements for non-purpose loans. Because all non-equity securities qualify for "good faith" margin under Regulation T, the 25% margin requirement under Rule 4210(c)(1) is currently both the initial and maintenance margin requirement for the non-margin eligible non-equity securities.

<sup>2</sup> The non-equity securities that would be rendered unmarginable by the Proposed Amendments are not limited to this category. Also rendered unmarginable would be any other non-investment grade non-equity securities that do not meet the requirements of the current definition of "other marginable non-equity securities," *i.e.*, because they have an original issuance of less than \$25 million, are issued by a company that does not report under Section 13(a) or 15(d) of the Exchange Act and is not an insurance company meeting the conditions of Section 12(g)(2)(G) of the Exchange Act, or are in default on interest or principal.

The term “non-margin eligible, non-equity security,” which is used in amended Rule 4210(c)(4), is not defined. Although it might be construed as referring to any non-equity security that is not a margin eligible non-equity security, from the context, the term should also exclude exempted securities, a highly rated foreign sovereign debt securities and listed non-equity securities.

\* \* \*

Thank you again for the opportunity to comment on the Proposed Amendments. If you have any questions about these comments, or would like to discuss any of them further, please do not hesitate to contact me at the phone number or e-mail address listed above.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'David Aman', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

David Aman

cc: Rudolph R. Verra, Managing Director, Risk Oversight and Operational Regulation  
Glen Garofalo, Director, Credit Regulation  
Steve Yannolo, Project Manager, Credit Regulation