

March 22, 2017

Michael S. Piwowar
Acting Chairman
U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission
100 F Street, NE
Washington, DC 20549-1090

Re: Reconsideration of Pay Ratio Rule Implementation

Dear Acting Chairman Piwowar,

We are writing as investors and investor organizations collectively representing \$3 trillion in assets under management to express our continued support for Section 953(b) of the Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act of 2010—the “pay ratio” disclosure requirement—and the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission’s August 5, 2015 final rule implementing this provision.

We strongly urge the SEC to maintain the effective date for disclosure by companies as stated in the final rule for “the first fiscal year beginning on or after January 1, 2017” which, for most companies, will mean in their 2018 proxy statements. Delaying the implementation of the rule will do a huge disservice to investors who have already waited nearly seven years for this material information.

The SEC’s pay ratio disclosure rule is thoughtful, balanced, and carefully crafted to provide companies considerable flexibility and makes accommodations to them in complying with the rule, while giving shareowners valuable new information with which to assess companies in their investment portfolio. Moreover, the SEC’s rule encourages companies to offer additional context for their pay ratio disclosures.

As investors, we believe that pay ratio information is material because it:

- Enables investors to make more informed decisions when casting advisory votes on executive compensation (“Say-On-Pay” votes). There is evidence that shareholders consider pay ratios as a measure of CEO pay reasonableness. A 2016 study of commercial banks that disclose average employee pay data found that companies with the highest pay ratios experienced “significantly greater shareholder dissent on SOP votes.”¹
- Provides employee pay data that is otherwise difficult and costly for investors to obtain on their own. Companies are not currently required to disclose data on their employees’ compensation, and the required disclosure of median employee pay will encourage greater

¹ Steven S. Crawford and Karen K. Nelson, *Mind the Gap: CEO-Employee Pay Ratios and the Shareholder Say on Pay Votes*, January 2016. Available at [https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/faculty-research/sites/faculty-research/files/CNR%20Jan2016%20\(002\).pdf](https://www8.gsb.columbia.edu/faculty-research/sites/faculty-research/files/CNR%20Jan2016%20(002).pdf)

transparency of human capital metrics. In the absence of company specific disclosures, investors are attempting to obtain human capital management data from companies.²

- Indicates a company's approach to balancing internal equity and external competitiveness when setting CEO pay targets. An overreliance on peer group benchmarking can contribute to a ratcheting up effect on CEO pay levels, leading one academic paper to conclude that "internal consistency, or pay equity, throughout the organization, up to and including the CEO, should be a natural and reasonable objective."³
- Sheds light on the impact of high CEO to employee pay ratios on employee morale. Public company employees are generally aware how much they make relative to their CEO, and high pay disparities may impact employee productivity. Wide pay gaps between CEOs and other employees are associated with higher employee turnover, which can adversely affect a company's performance and thereby shareholder interests.⁴
- Allows investors to see how pay ratios change at specific companies over time, and how companies within industries vary in their employee compensation strategies. Such disclosure can help inform investment decisions. According to a 2016 MSCI study, companies with higher CEO to employee pay gaps experienced lower profitability compared with peers with smaller pay gaps over a 5-year period from 2009 to 2014.⁵

For these reasons, pay ratio disclosure will provide material information to investors who are concerned about CEO and employee compensation and its impact on shareholder value. We call on the SEC to comply with Section 953(b) of the Dodd-Frank Act by maintaining the existing pay ratio disclosure rule. We note that this rule was adopted after an extensive rulemaking process and comment period. Any further delay will impose significant costs on investors who have been anticipating pay ratio disclosure according to the rule's existing timetable.

Sincerely,

² David McCann, *Big Leap Forward for Human Capital Disclosure*, CFO.com, May 20, 2016. Available at <http://ww2.cfo.com/disclosure/2016/05/big-leap-forward-human-capital-disclosure/>. See also Pensions & Investments Research Consultants Ltd. comment letter to the SEC, October 17, 2013. Available at <https://www.sec.gov/comments/s7-07-13/s70713-230.pdf>

³ Charles M. Elson and Craig K. Ferrere, *Executive Superstars Peer Groups and Overcompensation – Cause Effect and Solution*, Journal of Corporation Law, Spring 2013. Available at <http://lerner.udel.edu/centers/research-centers/john-l-weinberg-center-for-corporate-governance/executive-superstars-peer-groups-and-overcompensation/>

⁴ Matt Bloom and John Michael, *The Relationships Among Organizational Context, Pay Dispersion, and Managerial Turnover*, Academy of Management Journal, February 2002. Available at <https://www.jstor.org/stable/3069283>. See also James Wade, Charles O'Reilly III, and Timothy Pollock, *Overpaid CEOs and Underpaid Managers: Fairness and Executive Compensation*, Organization Science, October 2006. Available at <http://dx.doi.org/10.1287/orsc.1060.0204>

⁵ Samuel Block, *Income Inequality and the Intracorporate Pay Gap*, MSCI, April 2016. Available at <https://www.msci.com/www/research-paper/income-inequality-and-the/0337258305>

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 3

Paul Lee
Head of Corporate Governance
Aberdeen Asset Management

Kathy Woods
Chair
Adrian Dominican Sisters
Portfolio Advisory Board

Richard L. Trumka
President
AFL-CIO

Keith Mestrich
President
Amalgamated Bank

John Keenan
Corporate Governance Analyst
American Federation of State, County
and Municipal Employees

Lisa Donner
Executive Director
Americans for Financial Reform

Rosanna Landis Weaver
Program Manager, Power of the Proxy,
Executive Compensation
As You Sow

Ron Perrone
Director
ASB Capital Management LLC

Colette Murphy
Executive Director
Atkinson Foundation

Marie-Diane Deslauriers
Senior Manager - Institutional Markets
Batirente

RJ Devick
President
Bond & Devick Wealth Partners

Mary Ellen Madden
Shareholder Representative
BVM Shareholder Education &
Action Group

Anne Simpson
Investment Director
CalPERS

Stephen Viederman
Advisee
Christopher Reynolds Foundation

Shelley Alpern
Director of Social Research &
Shareholder Advocacy
Clean Yield Asset Management

Charley Beresford
Executive Director
Columbia Foundation

James A Frazin
Co-founder and CEO
Communitas Financial Planning Inc.

George Schmitz
Director Corporate Responsibility
Congregation of Holy Cross
Moreau Province

Sally Ann Brickner, OSF
Coordinator of Justice, Peace and
Integrity of Creation
Congregation of St. Agnes

Margaret Weber
Corporate Responsibility Director
Congregation of St. Basil

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 4

Karen Watson, CFA
Chief Investment Officer
Congregation of St. Joseph

Elizabeth Davis
Congregational Leader
Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy
of Newfoundland

Carol Thomas
Interim Chair - Investment Advisory Council
Connecticut Retirement Plans and
Trust Funds

Dieter Waizenegger
Executive Director
CtW Investment Group

Ann Roberts
ESG Analyst
Dana Investment Advisors

Sister Louise Gallahue, D.C.
Provincial
Daughters of Charity, Province of St. Louise

Mary Brigid Clingman, OP
Promoter of Justice
Dominican Sisters of Grand Rapids

Eileen Gannon
Leadership Team Member
Dominican Sisters of Sparkill

Cesare Vitali
Head of ESG Research
Ecofi Investissement

Jeff Pym
Executive Director
Evangelical Lutheran Foundation of
Eastern Canada

Susan Ernster, FSPA
Treasurer and CFO
Franciscan Sisters of Perpetual Adoration

Jeffery Perkins
Executive Director
Friends Fiduciary Corporation

David Schreiber
Investment Advisor and Financial Planner
Greenvest

Todd Walker
Financial Advisor
Greenvest

John Harrington
President and CEO
Harrington Investments, Inc.

Patricia Grant
Provincial Leader
Institute of the Blessed Virgin Mary
Canadian Province

Josh Zinner
CEO
Interfaith Center on Corporate Responsibility

Gary R Allen
General Vice President
International Association of Machinists and
Aerospace Workers

Sharan Burrow
General Secretary
International Trade Union Confederation

David Cohen
President
J. Zechner Associates Inc.

Christine Jantz
President
Jantz Management LLC

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 5

Jeffrey Scales
Managing Principal
JSA Financial Group

Clare Payn
Head of Corporate Governance
North America
Legal & General Investment Management

Larisa Ruoff
Director of Shareholder Advocacy
and Corporate Engagement
The Sustainability Group of
Loring, Wolcott & Coolidge

Scott Zdrazil
Senior Investment Officer –
Corporate Governance
Los Angeles County Employees
Retirement Association

William Gee
President and Director
Manaaki Foundation

Joseph P. La Mar
Assistant CFO
Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers

Cathy Rowan
Corporate Responsibility Coordinator
Maryknoll Sisters

Alan Spatrick
Managing Principal
Meketa Investment Group

Valerie Heinonen
Director, Shareholder Advocacy
Mercy Investments Services, Inc.

Alejando R Fernandez
Chairperson
Miami Firefighters' Relief & Pension Fund

Jay Youngdahl
Chairman, Board of Trustees
Middletown Works VEBA

Luan Jenifer
Executive Vice President
Miller/Howard Investments, Inc.

Mansco Perry III
Executive Director
Minnesota State Board of Investment

Bob Wyatt
Executive Director
The Muttart Foundation

Ronald Borst
Management Trustee
National Integrated Pension Plan

Hank Kim, Esq.
Executive Director & Counsel
NCPERS

Scott M. Stringer
New York City Comptroller
New York City Pension Funds

Thomas P. DiNapoli
New York State Comptroller
New York State Common Retirement Fund

Dan Rusnak
Trustee
Northern Nevada Laborers Pension Trust

Julie Goodridge
CEO
NorthStar Asset Management, Inc.

Judy Byron, OP
Northwest Coalition for
Responsible Investment

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 6

Denise L. Nappier
Connecticut State Treasurer
Office of the Connecticut State Treasurer

Seth M. Magaziner
General Treasurer, State of Rhode Island
Office of the General Treasurer

Michael Frerichs
Illinois State Treasurer
Office of the Illinois State Treasurer

Tobias Read
Oregon State Treasurer
Office of the Oregon Treasurer

Julie Gorte
*Senior Vice President for
Sustainable Investing*
Pax World Funds

Brian Coughlin
Trustee
Philadelphia Board of Pensions

Mark Peters
*Director of Justice, Peace
and Reconciliation*
Priests of the Sacred Heart, US Province

Catherine Cartier
President
Progressive Asset Management

Robert Baird
Director
Progressive Investment Management

Carsten Henningsen
Director
Progressive Investment Management

Michael Crosby
Corporate Responsibility Agent
Province of St. Joseph of the
Capuchin Order

Loic Dessaint
CEO
Proxinvest

Craig Rosenberg
President
ProxyVote Plus, LLC

Ruth Schaaf, OP
*Coordinator, Socially
Responsible Investments*
Racine Dominican Sisters

Jo Marie Chrosniak, HM
Coordinator
Region VI Coalition for
Responsible Investment

Patricia Jurewicz
Director
Responsible Sourcing Network

Maria Arabatzis
*Portfolio Manager and Shareholder
Engagement Manager*
Reynders, McVeigh Capital Management

Rozanna Patane
Owner
Rozanna Patane Financial Advisor LLC

Patti B. Dolan
Portfolio Manager
SAGE Investment Advisors
Raymond James

Helen Ninos
Interim Executive Director
School Employees Retirement
System of Ohio

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 7

Daniel Tretow
Director of Financial Services
School Sisters of St. Francis, Inc.

Jeffrey S. Davis
Executive Director
Seattle City Employees Retirement System

Maureen O'Brien
VP, Director of Corporate Governance
Segal Marco Advisors

Michael Crosby
Executive Director
Seventh Generation Interfaith Coalition
for Responsible Investing

Peter Chapman
Executive Director
Shareholder Association for
Research and Education

Richard Torgerson
CEO
SharePower Responsible Investing, Inc.

Sister Cecilia Hudec
Sisters of Charity Halifax

James Weber
Sisters of Charity of Cincinnati

Barbara Joseph Lammers, SCN
Corporate Responsibility Coordinator
Sisters of Charity of Nazareth

Margaret O'Brien
Congregation Treasurer
Sisters of Charity of New York

Mary Burns, SC
Congregation Representative
Sisters of Charity of Halifax

Denece Billesberger, sej
Treasurer
Sisters of Instruction of the Child Jesus

Sr Stella Chafe
Treasurer
Sisters of Saint Martha

Nora Nash
Director Corporate Social Responsibility
Sisters of St. Francis of Philadelphia

Elizabeth Cawley
Justice Promoter
Sisters of St. Joseph of Boston

Linda Hincken
CFO
Sisters of the Order of St Dominic

Ruth Geraets
Congregational Treasurer
Sisters of the Presentation of the
Blessed Virgin Mary

Maureen Welsh
Justice Representative
Society of the Holy Child Jesus

Danielle Jezienicki
Impact Analyst
Sonen Capital

Julie Wyne
Retirement Administrator
Sonoma County Employees'
Retirement Association

Euan Stirling
Head of Stewardship & ESG Investment
Standard Life Investments

Stephen Whipp
Managing Director
Stephen Whipp Financial

Letter to Michael S. Piwowar

March 22, 2017

Page 8

Anne Amanda Bangasser
Managing Director
Treehouse Investments LLC

Jonas Kron
Senior Vice President
Trillium Asset Management

Erik Breen
Manager SRI
Triodos Investment Management

Mary Beth Gallagher
Executive Director
Tri-State Coalition for
Responsible Investment

Meredith Miller
Chief Corporate Governance Officer
UAW Retiree Medical Benefits Trust

Jon Dunn
Chair of Trustees
UNISON Staff Pension Scheme

Timothy Brennan
Treasurer & CFO
Unitarian Universalist Association

Erik Mathiesen
CFO
The United Church of Canada

Lisa Woll
CEO
US SIF: The Forum for Sustainable
and Responsible Investment

Patricia Farrar-Rivas
CEO, Founding Partner
Veris Wealth Partners

Theresa Whitmarsh
Executive Director
Washington State Investment Board

Sonia Kowal
President
Zevin Asset Management